

ERIE COUNTY LEGISLATURE

HON. APRIL N.M. BASKIN

CHAIR OF THE LEGISLATURE

2ND DISTRICT LEGISLATOR



EC LEG JUL 8 '22 PM 1:22
2495 Main Street, Suite 450

Buffalo, NY 14214

716/895-1849

FAX: 716/895-1910

92 Franklin St., 4th Fl.

Buffalo, NY 14202

716/858-8869

FAX: 716/858-8895

July 7, 2022

Hon. Mark C. Poloncarz

Erie County Executive

95 Franklin St

Buffalo, NY 14202

District Director

Jakai Harrison

E-Mail: Jakai.Harrison@erie.gov

Dear County Executive Poloncarz,

I am writing to request your support in coordinating a public process that will enable the members of the Community Benefits Agreement (CBA) negotiating team to gain an understanding of what our community would like to be included in the proposed new stadium deal's CBA.

The Memorandum of Understanding guiding the new Bills Stadium states "*A Community Benefits Agreement ("CBA"), applying an inclusive process to document within the CBA the commitments to be made by the parties that will ensure the New Stadium will benefit not only the Team, but all segments of the local community including historically underserved communities within the County.*" (MOU I.G.v)

To date, there has been no formal meeting of the CBA's county negotiations team, which you stated you would convene shortly after your proposed stadium deal presentation at the county legislature on April 21st. I have concerns that because the MOU does not outline the specific CBA negotiation process prior to the September 1st deadline, the CBA stands in jeopardy of falling to the wayside in the overall stadium deal.

Other parts of the stadium planning process appear to be progressing. However, the CBA committee, which in my opinion is the most important component, has yet to meet to start negotiations. In April 2022, prior to the passage of the MOU, the media announced the Populous firm was confirmed by Pegula Sports and Entertainment as the proposed stadium architects (MOU IV.A). Most recently, it has been announced that three nationally acclaimed general contractor firms: Turner Construction Company, Gilbane Building Company, and Arc Building Partners have formed a coalition to construct the proposed new stadium. I also understand the Building & Construction Trades Council of Buffalo, New York has begun the preliminary phases of negotiating the required Project Labor Agreement (PLA, MOU IV.G). Additionally, your administration has proceeded with the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQR) process, which requires all state and local government agencies to consider the environmental impact of a project equally with social and economic factors. Seeing as all of the other agreements are progressing forward, it is vital that a robust, transparent process for the CBA begins as soon as possible so as to not delay the overall agreement for a new stadium in Erie County.

In light of the limited communication regarding the CBA and the concerns expressed by my colleague Legislator John Mills (COMM. 13E-7), I have summarized the work I have engaged in over the course of the past year in order to advocate for a strong CBA for the new Bills stadium. I held 25 community stakeholder meetings with local and national experts in the sectors outlined in my initial proposal on the need for a CBA, *Invest Well Erie*, which was released in September 2021. I have compiled the notes from

Website: <http://www2.erie.gov/baskin/> - E-Mail: April.McCants-Baskin@erie.gov

the various meetings into a community report so that the county's CBA committee has a baseline of community feedback from the suggested areas presented in *Invest Well Erie*.

I am also requesting that you direct the Erie County Division of Information and Support Services to design and launch a public comment page on erie.gov, for the purposes of allowing the residents of Erie County the opportunity to submit feedback on the enclosed report entitled "***Invest Well Erie: A Community Report***." This feedback should be made available to members of the CBA negotiating team in a timely manner.

Placing the enclosed community report online and soliciting input will allow for more organizations, our partners in government, and members of our community (beyond those I have already had the opportunity to engage with) to provide constructive feedback. Public input will help to focus and direct the discussions of the county's CBA committee.

A lack of participation from the residents, taxpayers, and Buffalo Bills fans of Erie County may result in the CBA having insufficient information as we negotiate for critical quality of life benefits for county residents. A failure to address community benefits may result in increased controversy at the time of official project approval, which is something I know we all want to avoid. Please review my enclosed report and convene the county's CBA committee.

Thank you in advance for your consideration and support.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "April Baskin".

April N.M. Baskin
Chairperson, Erie County Legislature
District 2



Invest Well Erie

CBA Community Report

*A summary of feedback on the 2021
"Invest Well Erie" CBA framework proposal
from community stakeholders*

Erie County Legislator

April N.M. Baskin

Chairwoman / District 2

Introduction

In September 2021, I submitted to your administration the initial *Invest Well Erie* proposal, which outlined the importance of including a Community Benefits Agreement (CBA), unprecedented in prior Erie County stadium negotiations, in the 2022 renegotiation of the Buffalo Bills stadium lease.

The original proposal was also circulated to Governor Hochul's office, members of the NYS Legislature's WNY delegation, and a number of community leaders and agencies. The original *Invest Well Erie* proposal outlined the rationale for a CBA and provided a framework of target areas and suggested investment amounts. The goal of *Invest Well Erie* was to provide the county's lease agreement negotiators with an understanding of the immediate quality of life needs of county residents. I am pleased that the final memorandum of understanding (MOU) declared that a CBA will be a required component of the new stadium deal.

The residents and Buffalo Bills fans of Erie County stand to be the chief investors in the new stadium. The following report provides a summary of various community stakeholder meetings held between September 2021 through July 2022. The stakeholders include countywide elected officials, non-profit organizations, block club leaders, educators, youth engagement specialists, small business owners, banking institutions, and public authority administrators. The report's suggested areas of investment were already identified in the 2021 original *Invest Well Erie* proposal; however, the *Invest Well Erie: A CBA Community Report* further breaks down specific ways in which community stakeholders would like to see the investments come to fruition.

Items outlined in this report with an asterisk (*) denote usage of funds from the Community Investment Fund, a 30-year financial commitment to be dispersed in annual allocations to establish, maintain and manage the operations costs of the asterisked project.

Stadium Community Investment Fund

Stakeholders in Attendance

Partnership for the Public Good; Buffalo Niagara Reinvestment Coalition

Summary of Meetings

Participants suggested that annual financial allocations from the Buffalo Bills should be made to the Erie County Stadium Corporation (ECSC), who then shall develop an annual CBA budget via a Community Benefits Oversight Committee, which should be a sub-committee of the ECSC. The grants shall be subject to majority vote approval of the CBA oversight committee before disbursement to selected organizations and/or projects that benefit youth and residents in underserved communities.

Recommendation

- The CBA must require the Buffalo Bills to finance a community investment fund focused on youth engagement, the county's higher education system, alleviation of poverty and disparities in the social determinants of health. The fund should commit to awarding a total of \$100 million in grants over the course of the thirty-year Stadium Lease.

Public Transportation

Stakeholders in Attendance

Niagara Frontier Transportation Authority & members of the WNY State Legislature delegation.

Summary of Meetings

Participants point out the fact that there is no public transportation within 1 mile of the current stadium location on weekends (the closest bus stop is over 2 miles away). This severely limits the pool of workers who can accept jobs at the stadium, and residents who can attend events at the stadium. The CBA agreement should require the Niagara Frontier Transportation Agency (NFTA) to expand its public transportation options within walking distance (¼ mile) of a new stadium. In the absence of new bus routes or shuttles provided by the NFTA, the CBA should require transportation be made available by the leaseholder on days there are events at the new stadium to allow for public transportation users to travel to work at the stadium or to attend events. Also, there is no safe walkway on Abbott Road to allow pedestrians to commute safely.

Recommendations

- Sidewalk improvements on all main access roads leading into the stadium to improve pedestrian safety.
- The creation by the Niagara Frontier Transit Authority of easily accessible, frequent public transportation options from a significant number of Erie County's disadvantaged communities to a location within 0.25 miles of the new stadium's location.
- A public transportation center built into the stadium design that includes heated interior waiting areas.
- A free gameday workforce shuttle service from Erie County's three cities (Buffalo, Lackawanna, and the City of Tonawanda) and select suburban and rural towns, which will allow for workforce transportation accessibility.

Erie County Public Education

Stakeholders in Attendance

Members of SUNY Erie Board of Trustees, SUNY Erie labor affiliate leaders.

Summary of Meetings

Participants noted that Buffalo Bills famed quarterback Josh Allen began his football career at a community college. The new stadium layout presented with the State Environmental Quality Review (SEQR) identifies that the SUNY Erie football field will be encumbered by the forthcoming new stadium. SUNY Erie South Campus is the college's only location with a football field. Currently, a large percentage of SUNY Erie's football team members are Black males, out-of-state students who are playing community college football with hopes of transferring to a Division-1 school. Displacing them and requiring these student athletes to upend their current routine can pose additional stress on individuals who are already responsible for navigating the barriers of travel to Orchard Park for football practice. The town of Orchard Park is limited in diversity, affordable housing options and public transportation options, which can all lead to increased food insecurity for student football players. The CBA should help alleviate the current barriers the SUNY Erie football players face and offer support in transitioning them out of their current college football routine and enabling them to excel as athletes while attending SUNY Erie. The Town of Amherst and the Amherst Chamber of Commerce have held meetings discussing how best to support and expand the SUNY Erie North Campus athletic center. The CBA should require the Buffalo Bills to financially contribute to expanding the North Campus athletic complex. The uncertainty as to the existence of the SUNY Erie South Campus should also allow for the creation and utilization of satellite classroom space built into the new stadium for southtown students and faculty. Additional student needs identified include the need for technology and computer access for SUNY Erie City Campus students. SUNY Erie culinary students would also benefit from the opportunity to enhance their culinary and hospitality skills by having access to the new stadium's food service equipment as well as participating in food services on game days.

Recommendations

- Access to stadium space for satellite classes/classrooms.
- Partnership with the SUNY Erie Culinary & Hospitality department for student learning experiences at the stadium.
- A commitment to upgrade the North Campus athletic amenities in partnership with the Town of Amherst and SUNY Erie.
- *Annual allocations (scholarships) to assist SUNY Erie football players with housing, transportation, & meal plans.
- The creation of a City Campus Tech Innovation Lab sponsored by the Buffalo Bills.
- *Financial allocations to support technology upgrades the City Campus tech lab equipment.

Youth Athletics & Mentorship

Stakeholders in Attendance

Administrators, teachers and coaches from the Buffalo Public School District and the Cheektowaga School District, former Buffalo Bills players, board members of the NYS section VI Athletic Council, representatives from Erie County's Boys & Girls clubs, Executive Directors from ten Buffalo based community centers, Little League coaches from the town of Hamburg, City of Tonawanda, and West Buffalo.

Summary of Meetings

Participants believe the investment of a \$1.4 billion-dollar professional sports stadium must in turn result in equitable investment in high quality sports experiences for our community's youth. Western New York has a long and storied history as a sports town, our community values athletics for their ability to encourage healthy lifestyles and the development of leadership skills. Our region's young people should see benefits from such a large contribution of tax dollars.

Many neighborhoods in Erie County struggle with a lack of access to programming for its young people. In some neighborhoods, programs do not exist, or the barriers (equipment costs, transportation, etc.) are too much of a burden to overcome for the residents. The CBA agreement should expand the current grants made by the Buffalo Bills to include financial and operational support to grow youth programs and agencies countywide, with a focus on athletic programs, into neighborhoods where no programming currently exists, and neighborhoods where there is a lack of access to transportation coupled with high poverty rates to ensure we are meeting our most vulnerable young people at a place where they are most comfortable.

Recommendation:

- Free field access to countywide little league and non-profit youth sports organizations by way of application and raffle process.
- Creation of a stadium "Community Suite"
 - The Community Suite will have "class days" - selected dates exclusively for use by school districts throughout Erie County to provide students the excitement and thrill of experiencing a Bills game in luxury with their classmates. Use of the suite for countywide schools would be determined by a raffle and families can enter the raffle by application.
 - The Community Suite will have "family game days" that enable low-income households countywide with at least one child under the age of 18 in Erie County to be selected for free access to games held at the stadium. The families can be selected by an application process. The CBA should seek to increase accessibility for all Erie County residents.
- *The implementation of an Athletic Equipment Grant Program for countywide little league and other non-profit youth sports organizations by way of application.
- The creation and implementation of a Buffalo Bills Sports Administrative Careers mentorship program, wherein 50% of participants live in a household below 60% of the Area Median Income. In addition to the jobs and opportunities created on-site, the new stadium should bolster the business acumen and profiles for many of the current beneficiaries of professional sports in Erie County. It is vital that access to boardrooms and decision-making scenarios are granted in order to widen the net of who benefits

from a billion-dollar economic development project. This program will emphasize a goal of improving diversity and inclusion in NFL and other professional sports front offices to ensure all future vice presidents, general managers, and chief executive officers have a pathway to these positions, regardless of what zip code they were born in.

Public Safety

Stakeholders in Attendance

Erie County Sheriff's Office, two MBE city/county certified security firms.

Summary of Meetings

Participants note that we have seen an intense focus on community police relations, both locally and nationally, particularly around the sensitivity to direct interactions between law enforcement and people of color. Currently, security at Highmark Stadium is handled by a mixture of the Erie County Sheriff's Office, the Buffalo Bills Security Team, and private security firms. As reported by the Erie County Police Reform Citizen Task Force, the Erie County Sheriff's Office Police Services Division (which provides security to the stadium) currently only has two police officers of color on their staff, out of the 146 officers in this division. The CBA must seek to improve the gameday experience for all fans by requiring the utilization of an MBE owned and operated security firm to improve the cultural and racial sensitivity on the stadium grounds, as well as an MBE owned security risk mitigation firm to help ensure public safety is built into the stadium's design. Members of disenfranchised communities should be provided with the opportunity to provide security services, helping to reverse narratives that portray minorities as dangerous or violators of the law. The new stadium is the perfect opportunity to be inclusive and to diversify law enforcement personnel and public safety firms in Erie County.

Recommendation

- The Stadium Security Agreement, or any similar agreement that determines the security arrangement for events and games at the New Stadium, must include a clause to require the inclusion of at least one certified minority-owned security firm to provide security.
- The Stadium Security Agreement, or any similar agreement that determines the security arrangement for events and games at the New Stadium, must include a clause to require the inclusion of at least one certified minority-owned risk mitigation firm contracted to review and assess all public safety threats in the stadium layout and design.

Stadium Concessions Agreement

Stakeholders in Attendance

Ten minority owned food and beverage entities, representatives from three major banking institutions, representatives from two food and beverage corporations headquartered in Erie County.

Summary of Meetings:

Participants say there is a particular need to provide resources and capital to underserved entrepreneurs in Erie County. The new stadium's concessions food service agreement should include a concessions contract that includes permanent product placement or reserves a specific percentage of concessions sales for MBE food & beverage entities. The contract should also call for mentorship from larger corporate food & beverage industry executives to the next generation of business leaders overcoming marginalization.

Recommendation:

- A concessions contract must include at least 10% of its sales (a combination of concession stands booths and/or food and beverage products) be generated from sub-contracts with restaurants or food & beverage retailers who are minority-owned and located within Erie County.
- The Concessionaire must agree to implement an MBE food and beverage mentorship program that includes capital investment in MBE restaurants, or other food or beverage entities for the term of the concessions agreement. The concessions contract will require the contractor to provide financial support and facilitate a food service small business assistance program/business incubator to help MBE food & beverage entrepreneurs expand their capacity and guide disadvantaged entrepreneurs toward industry sustainability.

Stadium Construction Workforce

Stakeholders in Attendance

Northland Workforce Training Center, Buffalo Urban League, Independent Contractors Guild of WNY, Associated Builders and Contractors, three County/City/State MWBE certified construction firms.

Summary of Meetings

Participants presented data showing that the unemployment rates of Black and Brown persons in Erie County has been double the unemployment rate of White people (White: 3.0%, Black: 5.8%, Hispanic/Latino: 7.7% US Census Bureau - ACS 2019). The benefits below seek to reverse those historic trends by emphasizing diversity, equity, and inclusion on the construction and operation of a new stadium in Erie County. The construction of a new stadium must have a benchmark of utilizing Minority and Women-Owned Businesses ("MWBE") for 30% of its contracting costs as required by State law. In addition to MWBE utilization, the new Stadium project should strive to have a diverse, inclusive workforce to tackle racial disparities in unemployment and the local labor forces related to the stadium's construction. The jobs created for this project must be well paying, labor protected jobs to ensure no workers are taken

advantage of during this project. Additionally, the CBA should call for the utilization of traditionally disadvantaged workers, giving them the opportunity to start their careers in the trades through the construction of the new stadium project.

According to the Department of Labor, there are vast disparities in our local workforce construction trade professions.

White men comprise the following percentages of Erie County's civilian labor force:

- 92.8% of first-line supervisors of construction trades and extraction workers
- 92.7% of pipelayers, plumbers, pipefitters and steamfitters
- 89.5% of carpenters
- 85.1% of painters
- 81.8% of electricians
- 79.8% of construction laborers

See Appendix A for more detail.

Participants presented data showcasing most locally owned MWBE firms are non-union and roughly 98% of the non-union MWBE firms have no affiliation with an apprenticeship program and there is limited assistance to allow these marginalized firms to access the capital needed to scale their businesses upward for competitive government contract bidding.

Recommendation:

- 30% of total labor hours performed in accordance with a lease or agreement shall be performed by disadvantaged workers. A disadvantaged worker is defined as an Erie County resident who has a household income below 50 percent of the Area Median Income ("AMI"); or has been released from prison within the last 10 years; or participates in the Temporary Assistance for Needy Families program; or participates in the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program; or has been unemployed for at least 12 consecutive months; or who resides in a zip code with a poverty rate of 20 percent or higher.
- The CBA should provide funding and support for the development of Pre-Apprenticeship Construction Trades Programs in collaboration with union and non-union contractors to prepare residents for construction jobs as well as funding for stipends, wraparound services, tools and personal protective equipment for Pre-Apprentices.
- A series of 3rd party independent compliance monitors are hired to track and document the workforce inclusion goals as well as the MWBE utilization goals.

Stadium Sub-Contractor MWBE

Stakeholders in Attendance

Northland Workforce Training Center, Buffalo Urban League, Independent Contractors Guild of WNY, Associated Builders and Contractors, three County/City/State MWBE certified construction firms.

Summary of Meetings

Participants believe the new stadium, as a multi-year construction project, can be the pipeline of inclusion for small MWBE's looking for the opportunity to expand their capacity, sustainability and workforce diversity.

Participants strongly encouraged the CBA to consider including MWBE customized participation contracts up to \$1 million. Participants requested the CBA require a series of third-party compliance monitoring hires for MWBE and Workforce participation outside of the Construction Manager to ensure accountability. They also noted the CBA should require monthly reporting for business utilization and workforce participation from project inception and require prospective prime firms to identify and confirm MWBE subcontractor agreement with the submission of bids. Provide a WNY Representative from Empire State Development located within WNY to help provide guidance, clarification, and support to MWBEs. Participants requested the CBA define commercially useful functions, provide working capital, lines of credit, 14-day quick pay for MWBE contractors. Prior to payment, receipts, invoices, certified payroll, etc. would need to be provided but this could provide opportunities for cash strapped MWBE contractors.

Participants stated the CBA should explore steps that can be taken to lighten the burden smaller MWBE's face when trying to gain access to steady government construction contracts that have strict compliance protocols. In the interest of increasing participation, MWBE contractors who bid on low dollar contracts should be relieved of certain protocols solely for the new stadium project. The goal being to provide these contractors with experience on a major construction project, enabling them to increase diverse workforce hires and ultimately provide them with the ability to scale up their small businesses during the course of this once-in-a-generation construction project.

Participants suggested the CBA should consider allowing MWBEs bidding on contracts of less than \$1 million dollars to have their "Core Employees" as their first hires, followed by a Journeyman. Redefine the "Core Employee" category for MWBE contractors and eliminate the "working 1000 total hours during prior 3 years" requirement. On bids less than \$1 million dollars eliminate the "were contractors' on active payroll for at least 60 out of 180 calendar days" requirement. To increase diversity on the project, include all minority and female workers as an excluded employee on bids less than \$1 million dollars. This will drive the demand for minorities and women on the project site. On bids less than \$1 million dollars, eliminate or provide waivers for MWBE contractors on apprenticeships. A waiver on bids less than \$1 million dollars would encourage bidding participation from more MWBE firms.

Small or startup MWBEs in the construction fields will face barriers and difficulties meeting the requirements of large-scale publicly funded construction projects. This once in a generation construction project should allow for these MWBEs to gain success and sustainability as entrepreneurs by creating a pipeline of burden-free awarded contracts.

Recommendation

- MWBE certified construction companies who bid on contracts under \$1 million dollars or who have a workforce of 51% minority or women employees are waived of the requirements prohibiting exclusion from qualifying for contracts under \$1 million dollars. If additional financial and technical assistance is provided to an MWBE to meet contract requirements, then the waiver of requirement shall not apply to the MWBE.

Post Construction Employment & Supplies

Stakeholders in Attendance

The Buffalo Black Chamber of Commerce, Jefferson Avenue Business Association, Buffalo State College Small Business Center, MWBE City/County/State certified suppliers and professional service firms.

Summary of Meetings

Participants stated that the agreement for a new stadium in Erie County should provide benefits for the community both inside and outside the stadium, as well as immediate, short-term benefits during the stadium's construction, and long-term benefits during the stadium's operation. The New Stadium will likely require a number of contracts with vendors to provide amenities that are typically provided at a professional sports and concert venue. Vendor contracts should be required to ensure the benefits generated by games and events at the New Stadium are spread across the Western New York business community and workforce pool. The CBA should require that any contract between the Bills and a third-party vendor regarding the sale of items, supplies, maintenance, or other contracted work, must include provisions that require at least 30% of the contract costs go towards an entity who is certified as a minority or women owned business enterprise. The certification should be from the Joint Certification Committee of Erie County and City of Buffalo or from the New York State Empire State Development. The sale of items includes but is not limited to merchandising & retail operations.

Recommendation:

- 30% of contracting costs, including but not limited to supplies, maintenance, renovations, and retail vendors operating on stadium grounds as defined in the lease must be MWBEs from Erie County and this requirement shall extend to any third-party or parties that are contracted to perform work or provide a service.

Social Determinants of Health
Affordable Housing, Fresh Food Access, Erie Health Equity

Stakeholders in Attendance: The Rural Outreach Center, the Community Health Center of Buffalo, The Partnership for Public Good, The Buffalo Center for Health Equity, Urban Family Practice, Lead 716, National Medical Association-Buffalo.

Summary of Meetings:

Participants say that sports arenas have a significant impact on real estate markets. The absence of this level of investment in a highly dense neighborhood with significant older housing stock, such as the City of Buffalo, will weaken its impact on improving housing conditions. In the absence of that market-based impact in the City of Buffalo, the CBA should allocate resources to improve the health and safety of Erie County's oldest housing stock. This agreement calls for a provision of the Community Investment Fund to provide funding support for affordable and mixed-income housing, with a particular interest in mixed-use developments that provide a basic community need, such as a grocery store or day care facility, to address the most basic needs of a disadvantaged community.

Recommendation:

*Financial support to agencies selected on an annual application basis for:

- One forthcoming affordable housing project. One food insecurity project facilitated by a non-profit agency. One health equity project by a nonprofit agency in Buffalo, or Tonawanda, or Lackawanna.
- One forthcoming affordable housing project. One food insecurity project facilitated by a non-profit agency. One health equity project by a nonprofit agency in a county town.
- One forthcoming affordable housing project. One food insecurity project facilitated by a non-profit agency. One health equity project by a nonprofit agency in a county village.

Recompensating Infrastructure Investment

Perry Homes, Cold Spring, & Fruit Belt neighborhoods - East Buffalo

Stakeholders in Attendance

Buffalo Municipal Housing Authority, the Fruit Belt Advisory Council President, members of the Buffalo Common Council

Summary of Meetings: Participants note that the City of Buffalo is our county seat. It is the core of our region's economic stability. Buffalo was also once home to The Buffalo Bills, as the team began its storied history playing at War Memorial Stadium on Jefferson Avenue. The Bills' departure from Buffalo's East Side was an example of an unfortunate trend over the last 50 years of significant divestment and disinvestment on Buffalo's East Side. Similar to the War Memorial Stadium example, there has been a limitation of investment in Buffalo Municipal Housing Authority's Commodore Perry Homes, due to its status as a likely location for the new Bills stadium. These two examples of disinvestment and divestment are intrinsically linked to the recent mass shooting rooted in racially motivated hatred that targeted the vulnerable underserved section of East Buffalo and devastated our region. The lack of proper investment in Buffalo's East Side over the past 50 years led to a persistently segregated city subject to targeting by a racist domestic terrorist. County government has a responsibility to solidify a

return on the \$250 million county share to strengthen the vulnerable neighborhoods throughout Erie County so that they are never again subject to the terror we witnessed on May 14, 2022. This return should be in the form of revitalization of projects occurring in locations previously tied to Stadium disinvestments and divestments, including but not limited to the Johnnie B. Wiley Stadium and the Commodore Perry Homes. The progress of both of these entities was stymied by 1.) the departure of the Buffalo Bills from the City of Buffalo and 2.) the limitation of investment in the Commodore Perry Homes due to its status as a likely location for the new Bills stadium. Both locations and entities in control of the operation of these locations should see specific allocations from the community benefits fund. The CBA should have specific restoration investments that will protect and heal the underserved residents housed in our county's most vulnerable communities.

Recommendation:

- In partnership with the City of Buffalo, the development of a neighborhood access center at the cross section of East Buffalo's Cold Spring and Fruit Belt neighborhoods
- * In partnership with the City of Buffalo, a full annual salary for an executive director position to be held by a person who is a resident of either Cold Spring or Fruit Belt.
- * In partnership with the City, an annual allocation to fund the operation costs of the neighborhood access center.
- Support for restoration of the Lanigan Field House
- Annual allocation for the Buffalo Municipal Housing Authority's Resident Services program, including annual funding for youth sports and recreation.
- Training of Commodore Perry Home residents for jobs at the new stadium, including security, vendors, etc., as well as a dedicated shuttle for transportation on days of employment.

Community Oversight Committee

Recommendation: The terms of the CBA agreement must be subject to oversight by the Erie County Stadium Community Benefits Committee ("CBC"), a sub-committee of the Erie County Stadium Corporation. On an annual basis, the CBC must show how grants were dispersed and detail the plan for the next year's disbursement. The CBC will provide opportunities for public engagement on how community benefit funding be dispersed. The transfer of the Capital Improvement Fund (MOU Section V(B)) and the Maintenance and Repair Fund (MOU Section V(C)) to the Bills is contingent on annual transfer of community benefit funds from the Bills to the CBC, as well as the review and approval of community investment funds by the CBC. The CBC shall provide an annual report to the Erie County Legislature on its actions, grant disbursements, and review of operations.

CBC will be a five-member board appointed as follows: two appointments from a public application process generated and voted on by the ECSC Board, one (1) appointment by the Erie County Executive, one (1) appointment by the Erie County Legislature Chairperson, one (1) appointment by the Erie County Legislature Minority Leader.

Conclusion

We have seen the benefits of Pegula Sports & Entertainment's ("PSE") and The Buffalo Bills' investment in the community thus far, from the Buffalo Bills Foundation's strong support of youth programming with the various Boys and Girls Clubs across Erie County, to its partnership with Habitat for Humanity to increase affordable housing. PSE is also lending its hand to the small business community by supporting Open4, a collaborative effort to catalyze systemic changes and help minority and women entrepreneurs realize their ambitions. It is clear from these commitments that PSE understands the importance of being a strong community partner on the elimination of disparities in Erie County and that the benefits outlined in this proposal are in line with the community-based work they've performed over the past few years. The construction of an estimated \$1.4 billion stadium is not just an opportunity to take our sports and leisure industry in Erie County to the next generation, but it is also an economic development opportunity to strengthen existing pipelines to sustainable careers and create new pipelines for upward mobility. A new billion-dollar economic development project for Erie County's most beloved institution will be a once in a generation accomplishment. We must make sure that accomplishment has a life-changing impact on the lives of all residents, including those that have historically been left out of once-in-a-lifetime projects. An investment of this scope will show our residents that we not only care about them, but will fight for them to benefit from this generational opportunity.

Appendix A
 Erie County Civilian Labor Force (16 Years and Over) by Race, Hispanic or Latino Origin, and Gender by Detailed
 Occupation
 EEO Tabulation 2014-2018 (5-Year American Community Survey Estimates)

Gender	Total		Race (Excluding Hispanic or Latino)												Hispanic or Latino	
			White Alone		Black or African American Alone		American Indian and Alaska Native Alone		Asian Alone		Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander Alone		Other Race			
	Estimate	Percent	Estimate	Percent	Estimate	Percent	Est	Percent	Estimate	Percent	Estimate	Percent	Est	Percent	Estimate	Percent

First-line supervisors of construction trades and extraction workers

Total	1,815	100.0	1,685	92.8	55	3.0	4	0.2	20	1.1	-	-	-	-	50	2.8
Male	1,750	96.4	1,615	89.0	55	3.0	4	0.2	20	1.1	-	-	-	-	50	2.8
Female	65	3.6	65	3.6	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Boilermakers

Total	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Brickmasons, blockmasons, stonemasons, and reinforcing iron and rebar workers

Total	470	100.0	470	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	470	100.0	470	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Carpenters

Total	2,565	100.0	2,295	89.5	175	6.8	10	0.4	10	0.4	-	-	15	0.6	55	2.1
Male	2,505	97.7	2,250	87.7	175	6.8	10	0.4	10	0.4	-	-	4	0.2	55	2.1
Female	60	2.3	50	1.9	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	10	0.4	-	-

Carpet, floor, and tile installers and finishers

Total	460	100.0	440	95.7	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	20	4.3
-------	-----	-------	-----	------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	----	-----

Male	460	100.0	440	95.7	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	20	4.3
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Cement masons, concrete finishers, and terrazzo workers																
Total	90	100.0	90	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	90	100.0	90	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Construction laborers																
Total	4,225	100.0	3,370	79.8	510	12.1	25	0.6	70	1.7	-	-	80	1.9	170	4.0
Male	4,140	98.0	3,325	78.7	480	11.4	25	0.6	70	1.7	-	-	80	1.9	160	3.8
Female	85	2.0	45	1.1	30	0.7	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	10	0.2
Construction equipment operators																
Total	960	100.0	915	95.3	-	-	20	2.1	-	-	-	-	4	0.4	20	2.1
Male	920	95.8	875	91.1	-	-	20	2.1	-	-	-	-	4	0.4	20	2.1
Female	40	4.2	40	4.2	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Drywall installers, ceiling tile installers, and tapers																
Total	355	100.0	300	84.5	35	9.9	-	-	-	-	-	-	20	5.6	-	-
Male	355	100.0	300	84.5	35	9.9	-	-	-	-	-	-	20	5.6	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Electricians																
Total	1,510	100.0	1,235	81.8	150	9.9	15	1.0	-	-	-	-	15	1.0	100	6.6
Male	1,505	99.7	1,230	81.5	150	9.9	15	1.0	-	-	-	-	15	1.0	100	6.6
Female	4	0.3	4	0.3	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Glaziers																
Total	135	100.0	135	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	135	100.0	135	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Insulation workers																
Total	80	100.0	75	93.8	-	-	-	-	4	5.0	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	80	100.0	75	93.8	-	-	-	-	4	5.0	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Painters and paperhangers																
Total	1,140	100.0	970	85.1	100	8.8	35	3.1	10	0.9	-	-	10	0.9	25	2.2
Male	970	85.1	800	70.2	100	8.8	35	3.1	10	0.9	-	-	10	0.9	25	2.2
Female	170	14.9	170	14.9	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Pipelayers, plumbers, pipefitters, and steamfitters																
Total	1,640	100.0	1,520	92.7	45	2.7	4	0.2	-	-	-	-	10	0.6	60	3.7
Male	1,615	98.5	1,520	92.7	45	2.7	4	0.2	-	-	-	-	10	0.6	35	2.1
Female	25	1.5	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	25	1.5
Plasterers and stucco masons																
Total	10	100.0	10	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	10	100.0	10	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Roofers																
Total	630	100.0	495	78.6	35	5.6	-	-	-	-	-	-	20	3.2	80	12.7
Male	630	100.0	495	78.6	35	5.6	-	-	-	-	-	-	20	3.2	80	12.7
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Sheet metal workers																
Total	380	100.0	325	85.5	55	14.5	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	380	100.0	325	85.5	55	14.5	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Structural iron and steel workers

Total	220	100.0	180	81.8	-	-	35	15.9	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	210	95.5	175	79.5	-	-	35	15.9	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	4	1.8	4	1.8	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Solar photovoltaic installers

Total	15	100.0	15	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	15	100.0	15	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Helpers, construction trades

Total	4	100.0	-	-	4	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	4	100.0	-	-	4	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Construction and building inspectors

Total	395	100.0	360	91.1	30	7.6	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	385	97.5	355	89.9	30	7.6	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	4	1.0	4	1.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Elevator and escalator installers and repairers

Total	60	100.0	60	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	60	100.0	60	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Fence erectors

Total	35	100.0	35	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	35	100.0	35	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Hazardous materials removal workers

Total	120	100.0	110	91.7	10	8.3	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	120	100.0	110	91.7	10	8.3	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Highway maintenance workers

Total	610	100.0	485	79.5	120	19.7	-	-	-	-	-	-	4	0.7	-	-
Male	585	95.9	460	75.4	120	19.7	-	-	-	-	-	-	4	0.7	-	-
Female	30	4.9	30	4.9	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Rail-track laying and maintenance equipment operators

Total	25	100.0	25	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	25	100.0	25	100.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Other construction and related workers

Total	135	100.0	85	63.0	50	37.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Male	135	100.0	85	63.0	50	37.0	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Female	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-